

U.S. Department of Health & Human Services



Center for  
Scientific Review

# CSR Diversity Initiatives

ACD Diversity Workgroup Subcommittee on Peer Review  
Early Career Reviewer (ECR) Program

Monica A. Basco, Ph.D., Scientific Review Officer

*"Diversity is the only true thing we all have in common, so we should celebrate it."*

Yvonne Maddox, NICHD Deputy Director

# Subcommittee on Peer Review

Joan Y. Reede, M.D., M.P.H., M.S., M.B.A. Dean of Diversity and Community Partnership Harvard Medical School	Valerie Reyna, Ph.D. Professor of Human Development and Psychology Cornell University
Dana Y. Takagi, Ph.D. Professor of Sociology and Chair of the Department of Education University of California, Santa Cruz	Jenessa R. Shapiro, Ph.D. Assistant Professor of Psychology University of California, Los Angeles
John F. Dovidio, Ph.D. Professor of Psychology Yale University	Oscar Ybarra, Ph.D. Professor in Social Psychology University of Michigan
Gordon B. Moskowitz, Ph.D. Professor and Chair of Psychology Lehigh University	Richard Nakamura, Ph.D. Director Center for Scientific Review
Monica A. Basco, Ph.D., Exec Sec	Denise McGarrell, BS, Program Analyst

# Progress Report

## Subcommittee on Peer Review Meetings

4 full committee, 7 Co-chair meetings, 3 workgroup meetings

## Projects funded:

- Survey and Focus Group contract awarded to SSI, Inc.
- 1-R01-GM-111002-01 “*Exploring the Science of Scientific Review*” funded, Molly Carnes, PI (\$2,900,000)
- CIT text analysis software project

Analysis of parent education and grant funding completed by Robin Wagner

COSWD Sponsored *Diversity and Inclusion* workshop for NIH leadership

Frances Carter-Johnson, Ph.D, AAAS S&T Policy Fellow joined CSR

Early Career Review Program continues to grow

## What factors may contribute to the disparity in grant funding?

Bias in  
Peer  
Review

Grant  
Writing  
Experience

Quality or  
Type of  
Science



# Bias in Peer Review

## Anonymizing Experiments

- 2-Stage review with anonymized Aims and Research Strategy (RFP)
- Alter PI race, gender, institution (Carnes)

## Detection of Bias

- Survey and focus groups with minority PIs
- **Challenge.gov** solicitation to develop method
- Text analysis of Summary Statements (Carnes)
- Discourse Analysis (Carnes)

## Bias Awareness Training

- Consultation with NSF and OPM
- **Challenge.gov** Solicitation
- NIH Diversity Workshop

# Grant Writing Experience

Limited Experience  
and/or Access to  
Experienced Mentors

- Survey & Focus Groups of minority PIs
- **NRMN** – National Research Mentoring Network

Deficits in Grant Writing

- Grammar/spelling analysis of grant applications
- “Grantsmanship” scale

Limited Institutional  
Experience with Grants

- Survey & Focus Groups of Minority PIs
- **BUILD** – Building Infrastructure Leading to Diversity

# The Proposed Science

**Under-recognized or under-valued areas of science**

- Influence of innovation scores on overall impact scores (OER)

**Questions related to Significance of proposed work**

- Text analyses of critiques
  - Carnes Grant
  - CIT Text analysis software

**Problems with the Approach**

- Approach scores predict overall impact
  - Additional analyses planned

# **Early Career Reviewer Program**

**Karyl B. Swartz, Ph.D., Director**  
**Monica A. Basco, Ph.D., ECR Coordinator**  
**David Benn, BS, Program Analyst**

# Progress to Date

- 3,200 **applications received** from 636 institutions\*
- 2,384 ECRs have been **accepted** into the program
- 1,086 study sections to date have included an ECR
  - 785 have **served** on at least **one** study section
  - 301 have **served** on **two** study sections
- All IRGs have included ECR on their rosters

\*as of 9/18/13

# Recruitment Patterns of ECR Applicants

Percent of applicants and schools represented by institution type

Type of Institution	% of applicants (n = 3,200)	% of schools (n=636 )
R15 Eligible Institutions	26%	21%
Historically Black Colleges and Universities	2.8%	3%
Hispanic Serving Institutions	4.6%	6%
Tribal Colleges and Universities	<1%	<1%

# ECR database Demographics

Group	% of 2,379 in database	% of 786 who served as reviewers
Black/African American	7.7%	15.8%
Hispanic	5.9%	10.4%
American Indian/Alaskan Native	1%	1.2%
Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander	0%	0%
Overall Under-Represented Minority	14.4%	27.4%
Female	42.8%	50%

# ECR Program Accomplishments

- EAVS – ECR Application and Vetting System software
- Outreach
  - ECR Program Video
  - Communication Consultant shaped ECR messaging
  - Conference Exhibit enhancements
  - Article in *Science* Career Section
  - Conference outreach presentations
- Performance tracking in QVR
  - ECR added as a reviewer type of facilitate tracking of application submissions and funding